# State of California



# Employment Training Panel

Arnold Schwarzenegger, Governor

August 10, 2009

Katherine A. Leahy, President/CEO Goodwill Industries of Ventura & Santa Barbara Counties 130 Lombard St. Oxnard, CA 93030

Dear Ms. Leahy:

RE: <u>FINAL MONITORING REPORT</u> for Goodwill Industries of Ventura & Santa Barbara Counties – ET07-0355

Date of Visit 07/21/09

Time of Visit 9 a.m. to 11 a.m.

Location of Visit Oxnard

Persons in Attendance Bruce Wilroy, VP of Workforce Services, Goodwill

Carmen Fraser, Vocational Director, Goodwill

Naomi Weingart, ETP Contract Analyst

Date of Last Visit 06/10/08

Action Required No

# **CONTRACT INFORMATION**

Term of Agreement	05/08/07 - 05/07/09	Agreement Amount	\$162,765
Type of Trainee	New Hire	Number to Retain	45
Training Start Date	05/21/07	Range of Hours	100 - 300
Date Training Must Be Completed	02/06/09	Weighted Avg Hrs	200

## Project Statistics from the Contractor & the ETP Online Class/Lab Tracking System

Trainees Started Training	34	Completed Training	29
Trainees Enrolled	34	Completed Retention	9
Dropped Following Enrollment	3	In Retention Period	0
No. Completed Minimum Reimbursable Hours	29	New Hires Awaiting Placement	0

#### TRAINING STATUS

Training began May 21, 2007 and ended February 5, 2009 for unemployment insurance recipients, Welfare to Work participants, and individuals with multiple barriers to employment. One Amendment was processed in June 2007 to add the SET multiple barriers category to the training plan. Classes were held on an open entry, open exit basis.

The online Class/Lab Tracking system shows that trainees received between 107 and 300 hours of training; 29 trainees completed all training. You received reimbursement for nine trainees (six from Job 1, and three from Job 2) that were placed into employment and retained for 90-days. Total earnings were \$33,321, or 20.4% of the contract funding amount. Attendance rosters show that trainees often exceeded the maximum hours specified on Chart 1; and that you provided Job Club hours outside of ETP training at your own expense to teach resume writing, job application completion, and work ethics.

Mr. Wilroy reported your training program continues to serve the hard-core unemployed, and that the Goodwill added a second classroom to increase its training capacity. Some of the trainees found excellent jobs (e.g. office manager, credit counselor, medical front office, and one became an instructor with the Goodwill); several trainees relocated or commute to work; and the wages were generally good, averaging \$13/hour.

On the other hand, many trainees departed after training and could not be contacted, while others refused to take job referrals and/or go to work. This scenario, and training coordinator's absence for over six months, were responsible for the low completion rate. When Mr. Wilroy took over, the program was re-evaluated and advertising and enrollment increased, but it was late in the contract and Goodwill ran out of contract time for some of the newer enrollees to complete training and/or to be placed within the ETP contract term.

According to prior monitoring reports, Job 1 for UI recipients and exhaustees did well due to referrals from the City of Ventura; Job 2 for CalWORKS recipients also did well because trainees received a lot of supportive services. Job 3 for trainees with multiple barriers, however, did not prove to be successful because applicants had an abundance of personal issues that kept them from going to work, and the ETP minimum wage of \$10.94 per hour was too high. Staff had also reported that that placement, in general, was more difficult in today's labor market due to a shortage of jobs, competition for openings, and clothing and transportation (gas prices) issues.

Otherwise, staff felt that monitoring was adequate and the ETP online systems were user-friendly. Goodwill's new ETP Agreement was scheduled for the June 2009 Panel meeting that was cancelled; it may now be considered for September 2009.

#### ATTENDANCE ROSTERS/INVOICES

The Monitor reviewed all class/lab rosters for four trainees (Dillon, Zavala, Agcaoili, and Luquin) from Job Numbers 1 and 2 that were invoiced for P2 (completion of training) and P4 (final payment) on Invoices 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, and 11. Except for instructor signatures, records indicated that ETP requirements were met and properly documented on the sampling: the Training Plan was followed and the curriculum was provided as specified in Exhibit B. Since rosters are individual, class size was not indicated, but each training room has fewer than 15 workstations so that classes must stay within the 1:15 trainer to trainee ratio.

# Attendance Rosters (continued):

Out of 133 training dates entered online, there were no instructor signatures for 20 days (15%). Mr. Wilroy commented that the regular instructor had left Goodwill, and that classes were covered on those days by three other qualified staff who neglected to sign the ETP rosters. He provided secondary source documentation to show that the trainers were present and paid on the days in question.

These findings are based only on the training records reviewed during this visit and represent only a sample of the training records completed to date. It is your responsibility to ensure that 100% of all training records are in compliance with Panel requirements prior to the closeout of this Agreement (Reference: Title 22 California Code).

## **AUDIT**

Goodwill will be notified in writing if this Agreement is selected for a field audit (conducted at your worksite) or a desk audit (conducted by telephone). Audit Notification and Confirmation letters will be sent in advance to allow ample preparation time, and will include a list of documentation that the auditor may examine. Original training attendance documentation is required; photocopied records are not acceptable. Listed below are types of records typically requested during an ETP field audit:

- Training attendance records such as rosters and sign-in sheets;
- Payroll records of individual trainees to verify wages and hours worked;
- Personnel records regarding occupations and dates of employment;
- Documentation of employer paid health benefits (if applicable); and
- Cash receipts to verify receipt and accounting of ETP funds.

# RECORD RETENTION

Records must be retained within your control and be available for review at your place of business within the State of California. This responsibility will terminate no sooner than four (4) years from the date of the termination of the Agreement or three (3) years from the date of the last payment by ETP to the Contractor, or the date of resolution of appeals, audits, claims, exceptions, or litigation, whichever is later.

Please contact your Monitoring Analyst within ten working days at (818) 755-3633 or <a href="mailto:nweingart@etp.ca.gov">nweingart@etp.ca.gov</a> if you have any questions or comments. Thank you for your participation in the ETP training program, and we look forward to working with you again in the near future.

Sincerely,

Signature on File

Wally Aguilar, Program Manager North Hollywood Regional Office

# Signature on File

Naomi Weingart, Contract Analyst Los Angeles Regional Office

Cc: Bruce Wilroy, Vice President of Workforce Services, Goodwill (email)

David A. Guzman, Chief, Audits & Program Operations Division (email)

ETP Master File ETP Project File

Date report mailed to Contractor <u>08/17/09</u>